The RYS Daily 8/20/06 More on Eating on Yom Kippur

The following is from the Making of a Godol, Volume 1, Improved Edition, pages 1114 - 1115.

The S'redei Aish has a version different from my father's i.e., the Chafetz-Chaim's - of what transpired in the wake of R' Yisrael's daring act, to wit: "When R' Yisrael found out that many of the older rabbanim were angry with him, he announced that he would deliver a pilpul in the Great Synagogue. The lomdim assumed that his exposition would propound a halakhic justification for his unusual deed, and they all gathered to hear him. Instead, he delivered a profound shi`ur on another subject altogether, which surpassed in acuity and virtuosity all the other pilpulim that he had presented in Vilna until then. With this, all his opponents were silenced." It may be conjectured that R' Yisrael deliberately chose not to discuss the halakhic aspect of what he had done on Yom Kippur because he did not want the people who had eaten because of his announcement to feel that what they had done needed justification. R' Yisrael's rebuttal of the Vilna beth din, both according to the author S'redei Aish R' Weinberg's version and my father's, is a fine demonstration of the Salanter's greatness in Torah.

Earlier issues of The Daily Salanter are at http://www.stevens.edu/golem/llevine/salanter/